

CRITICAL COMMENTARY

In the Critical Commentary the following conventions are used:

- 1** “by analogy with” is used when something has been “added”, “emended” or “omitted” by analogy with another passage in the main source. The analogy may be vertical. When something is added “by analogy with” one or more instruments, it is understood that the analogy is with the same place in the same bar(s).
Or it may be horizontal. When something is added “by analogy with” one or more bars, it is understood that the analogy is with a parallel place in the same instrument(s).
- 2** “as in” is used when something is “added”, “emended” or “omitted” to correspond to the same place in another source.
- 3** “in accordance with” is used in cases where there is no authoritative source, only a guideline – for example printed part material.

In the bar number column, the symbol “+” is used to indicate an upbeat to the bar in question.

SOURCES

- A** Printed score, Carl Nielsen’s copy
- B** Score, autograph, Carl Nielsen’s printing manuscript
- C** Printed parts used by Carl Nielsen
- D** Manuscript parts
- E** Score, partly autograph, draft
- F** First page of autograph score in facsimile
- G** Sketches
- H** Printed score, Musikforeningen’s copy
- I** Printed parts, Musikforeningen’s copies
- J** Printed score used by Carl Nielsen in Gothenburg
- K** Printed parts used by Carl Nielsen in Gothenburg
- L** Printed score used by Launy Grøndahl
- M** Printed parts used by Launy Grøndahl
- N** Printed pocket score

DESCRIPTION OF SOURCES

- A** Printed score, Carl Nielsen’s copy
DK-Kk, CNS 65f.
Title page: “Wilhelm Hansen Edition / Det Uudslukkelige / Das Unauslöschliche – The Inextinguible / Symphonie für Orchester Symphony for Orchestra / Carl Nielsen / Op. 29 / Partitur Orchestra Score / Stimmen Orchestra Parts / Dubletten Extra Parts /
Öffentliche Aufführung dieses Wer-/kes ist nur gestattet, wenn der Ver-/anstalter das Aufführungsrecht erwor-/ben, nachweislich das gesamte Noten-/material aus erster Hand bezogen und / vorher eine Übereinkunft mit dem / Verleger stattgefunden hat[.] Das Ver-/leihen und Abschreiben des Materials / ist verboten.
Public performance of this work is / only allowable if the Manager has / duly acquired the performing right / and notoriously received all the music / from the editor by virtue of previous / agreement. It is not allowed to lend / or copy this composition.
Eigentum des Verlegers für alle Länder – Propriété pour tous pays / Aufführungsrecht vorbehalten – Droits de représentation réservés / Kjøbenhavn & Leipzig / Wilhelm Hansen, Musik-Forlag / Kristiania / Norsk Musik-Forlag / Brødrene Hals-Warmuth-Wilhelm Hansen Stockholm / A. B. Nordiska Musikförlaget / Scholander – Wilhelm Hansen / Paris / Dépositaire exclusif pour la France / Max Eschig / Bruxelles / Dépositaire exclusif pour la Belgique / Sole Agents / London / Augener Ltd. / Boston, Mass. U. S. A. / The Boston Music Co. / 26 & 28 West St. / New York / G. Schirmer, (Inc.) / Copyright 1916 by Wilhelm Hansen, Leipzig.”.
Pl. No.: 16557 (1916).
From the estate of Irmelin Eggert Møller, donated by her husband, Professor Eggert Møller in 1975.
32.8x26.2 cm, 111 pp., brown half-binding.
The score has a few additions and corrections in pencil in Carl Nielsen’s hand. On the back of the title page, a sheet of lined paper has been pasted in (17.9x13.9 cm), on which

Carl Nielsen has added the heading *Das Unauslöschliche*. Below, in another hand, is the German translation of the composer's preface to the work, which has been copied into the study score.

- B** Score, autograph, Carl Nielsen's printing manuscript.
DK-Kk, CNS 65a.
Title page: "Det Uudslukkelige / Das Unauslöschliche.
L'instinguibile / Symfoni for Orkester / af / Carl Nielsen"
(written on label)
Donated to the Royal Library by Irmelin Eggert Møller,
Anne Marie Telmányi and Wilhelm Hansen Musik-Forlag in
1953.

35.7x26.9 cm, 168 numbered pages written in black and at some points in blue ink, and in pencil and blue crayon, partly in the composer's, partly in the music engraver's hand. Figures have also been added in blue crayon. The manuscript is bound in brown, stiff boards, which are again bound in brown half-binding. On pp. 1-99 with few exceptions, braces, instrument names, clefs, key signatures and bar divisions have been added by Knud Jeppesen.

On the back of the board front cover, in pencil, an autograph sketch for the vl.1 part bb.971-982 and the vc. part bb.972-979.

Paper type: B.&H.Nr.13.A.7.14., with 22 staves.

- C** Printed parts, have been used by Carl Nielsen
DK-Kk, C II, 10.
Wilhelm Hansen, Musik-Forlag. Plate Number: 16557
Donated to the Royal Library by Irmelin Eggert Møller in
1958.
34.2x26.9 cm, 45 parts
The parts have numerous additions by the musicians and a number of additions in blue crayon in Carl Nielsen's hand.

- D** Parts in manuscript
DK-Kk, CNS 65e.
Donated to the Royal Library by Irmelin Eggert Møller in
1958.
34.9x26.8 cm, 18 parts, [binding][written in black ink]
Paper type: 10, 12 and 14 staves.
5 vl.1 (nos. 2-6), 5 vl.2 (nos. 2-6), 3 va. (nos. 2-4), 3 vc. (nos. 2-4), 2 cb. (nos. 2-3).
In the parts figures in blue crayon have been added, and in Carl Nielsen's and other hands corrections and additions in blue crayon as well as a few in pencil and red crayon. Each part is dated and signed Johannes Andersen, Copenhagen. The dates cover the period 17-22.1.1916.

Amongst the part material are four insertions for the viola parts 1-4 in Carl Nielsen's hand. The insertions consist of halved music sheets with 6-7 staves written in black ink and furnished with the pencil inscription "For Viola No. 1" etc. in Nielsen's hand. The music is bb. 559-581, and the violas, instead of following the double basses — as was originally the case in Johannes Andersen's viola parts — are to follow the cellos. With a few changes in articulation the music of these insertions has been added to the printed edition of the score.

- E** Pencil draft
DK-Kk, CNS 65b.
Donated to the Royal Library by Professor Knud Jeppesen in 1965.
35.2x27 cm, 152 pp. written in pencil. Pages 103-106 are the woodwind and horn parts written by Knud Jeppesen. In the score blue crayon has been used for corrections and additions (e.g. of figures), as well as red crayon and black ink. Brown half-binding

pp. 1-76:	B.&H.Nr.13.A.S.10.	(22 staves)
pp. 77-80:	B.&H.Nr.14.A.7.09.	(24 staves)
pp. 81-84:	B.&H.Nr.13.A.S.10.	(22 staves)
pp. 85-100:	B.&H.Nr.13.A.1.13.	(22 staves)
pp. 101-106:	B.&H.Nr.14.A.7.09.	(24 staves)
pp. 107-134:	B.&H.Nr.13.A.7.14.	(22 staves)
pp. 135-138:	B.&H.Nr.13.A.1.13.	(22 staves)
pp. 139-152		

2 unnumb. pp., with writing on the first:

B.&H.Nr.13.A.7.14. (22 staves)

On the title page Knud Jeppesen has written in blue ink: "Carl Nielsen: / Symfoni Nr.4. "Det Uudslukkelige" / Partitur / Autograf / Opført 1^{ste} Gang ved Musikforeningens Koncert d. 1^{ste} Februar 1916 / under Komponistens egen Ledelse."¹The bars of the first and second section have been numbered sequentially, after which (b. 543 in the present edition) a new bar numbering begins.

- F** Facsimile of autograph score
Facsimile of the first page of the symphony in Carl Nielsen's autograph printed in Gerhardt Lyng: *Danske Komponi-*

1 "Carl Nielsen: / Symphony No. 4. "The Inextinguishable" / Score / Autograph / Performed 1st time at Musikforeningens Concert, the 1st February 1916 / conducted by the composer."

ster i det 20. Aarhundredes Begyndelse, Aarhus et al. 1917, 1st ed., pp. 112f, 2nd ed., p. 223.

According to a letter from G. Lynge to Carl Nielsen dated Aarhus 14.12.1915 (*DK-Kk*, CNA, I.A.b.) Lynge asked for among other things “a manuscript page for reproduction.” The original source is not known. Differs in a number of respects from **B**.

G Sketches

DK-Kk, CNS 65c and 65d.

Donated by Irmelin Eggert Møller in 1958.

65c: 1 sheet 35.6x27.1 cm, B.&H.Nr. 13. **A** (22 staves)

“The sketch consists of drafts of the first and second parts of the symphony, a piece for male choir (“Fredlys din Jord”) and a short unidentified D minor piece on two staves.

65d: 1 sheet 34.8x26.1 cm “Heimdal” 1652 (12 staves)

The sketch consists of drafts for bb. 215 ff.

H Printed score, Musikforeningen’s copy

DK-Kk, Mf. 1438.

Title page: as **A**.

Bought by the Royal Library in 1937.

32.3x26 cm, 111 pp., green half-binding

I Printed parts, once belonged to Musikforeningen

DK-Kk, Mf. 1438.

Accessioned by the Royal Library in 1945.

Wilhelm Hansen, Musik-Forlag, plate number: 16557 (1916).

34x27 cm, 45 parts, unbound.

The parts have a few corrections in blue crayon.

J Printed score used by Carl Nielsen in Gothenburg

Title page: as **A**.

33x27.3 cm, 111 pp., bound with spine and corners in unbleached cloth with a cover of marbled paper in the colours blue, red, brown, dark grey and beige/light yellow on a white ground. In recent years the score has been restored.

K Printed parts used by Carl Nielsen in Gothenburg

Same edition as **C**.

L Printed score used by Launy Grøndahl,

Radio Denmark, Music Archives

Title page: as **A**.

32.8x26.2 cm, 111 pp.

At the beginning of the score, in Launy Grøndahl’s hand, partly in ballpoint, partly in black ink:

“Denne Symfoni har Carl Nielsen ikke direkte gennemstuderet med mig, men jeg har hørt flere af de første Opførelser efter dens Fremkomst. Under Prøverne til en af disse talte jeg med Carl Nielsen og vi kom ind på Spørgsmaalet om at kunne høre eller ikke kunne høre Begyndelsesmotivet/Første Takt. Han indrømmede at de to Trioler vanskelig ‘kom igennem’ - jeg kunne nu overhovedet ikke høre dem.

Så ung jeg var turde jeg selvfølgelig ikke foreslå en Ændring i Instrumentationen, men mærkelig nok rettede han selv intet da Værket tryktes.

Ved min (første) Opførelse af Symfonien i Dec: 1950 har jeg foretaget væsentlige Rettelser, - Forstærkninger af Temaet som måtte ske hvis Temaet skulle høres. Ligeledes Pag:36 har jeg væsentligt forstærket de to Trioler og foretaget andre Retoucher. - Carl Nielsen anbragte den ene af de to Paukister foran, helt til højre foran 1^{m[ol]} Violinernes sidste Pulte.

Launy Grøndahl 31.8.51

Alle (?) de Mængder af Fejl der findes i Partitur og Stemmer har jeg rettet, dog tror jeg at der endnu er Fejl som er undgået min Opmærksomhed.

L.Gr.”²

Beneath this text Grøndahl listed his performances of the work with the Danish Radio Symphony Orchestra.

2 “Carl Nielsen did not directly go through this symphony with me, but I have heard several of the first few performances after its appearance. During the rehearsals for one of these I spoke to Carl Nielsen and we got on to the question of being able to hear or not being able to hear the introductory motif/first bar. He admitted that the two triplets had difficulty “getting through” – I could in fact not hear them at all. Young as I was, I did not of course dare to suggest a change in the instrumentation, but oddly enough he himself changed nothing when the work was printed. For my (first) performance of the symphony in December 1950 I made substantial changes – reinforcements of the theme that had to be done if it was to be heard. Similarly at page 36 I have considerably strengthened the two triplets and retouched in other places. Carl Nielsen placed one of the two timpanists in front, to the far right in front of the 1^{m[ol]} violins’ last seat. Launy Grøndahl 31.8.51

All (?) the many errors in the score and parts I have corrected, yet I think that there are still errors that have escaped my attention.

L.Gr.”

M Printed parts, Launy Grøndahl's material

N Printed pocket score

Title page: "Wilhelm Hansen Edition / Det Uudslukkelige / Das Unauslöschliche – The Inextinguible / Symphonie für Orchester – Symphony for Orchestra / Carl Nielsen / Op. 29 / Partitur Orchestra Score / Stimmen Orchestra Parts / Dubletten Extra Parts / Öffentliche Aufführung dieses Werkes ist nur gestattet, wenn der Ver-/ansteller das Aufführungsrecht erworben, nachweislich das gesamte Noten-/material aus erster Hand bezogen und / vorher eine Übereinkunft mit dem / Verleger stattgefunden hat[,] Das Ver-/leihen und Abschreiben des Materials / ist verboten. / Public performance of this work is / only allowable if the Manager has / duly acquired the performing right / and notoriously received all the music / from the editor by virtue of previous / agreement. It is not allowed to lend / or copy this composition. / Studien-Partitur. / Diese Partitur darf **nicht** bei öffent- / lichen Aufführungen benutzt werden. / Study-Partition. / It is **not** allowed to use this partition / for public hearings. / Eigentum des Verlegers für alle Länder – Propriété pour tous pays / Aufführungsrecht vorbehalten – Droits de représentation réservés / Kjøbenhavn & Leipzig / Wilhelm Hansen, Musik-Forlag / Kristiania / Norsk Musik-Forlag / Brødrene Hals-Warmuth-Wilhelm Hansen / Stockholm / A. B. Nordiska Musikförlaget / Scholander – Wilhelm Hansen / Sole Agents / London / Augener Limited / Boston, Mass U. S. A. / The Boston Music Co. / 26 & 28 West St. / New York / G. Schirmer, (Inc.) Pl. No.: 16661 (1916). Photographic (reduced) print of the printed score, apparently the same version as **A**. 111 pp.

On the back of the title page: "‘Det Uudslukkelige.’ / Komponisten har ved Anvendelsen af Titlen ‘Det Uudslukkelige’ / med et enkelt Ord søgt at antyde, hvad kun selve Musikken har / Magt til fuldt at udtrykke; den elementære Villie til Liv. / Musik er Liv, som dette uudslukkelig. Derfor kunde det Ord / Komponisten har sat over sit Værk, synes overflødig; han har imid- / lertid anvendt det for at understrege sin Opgaves strengt musikalske / Karakter. Intet Program, men en Vejviser ind paa Musikens eget / Omraade. / ‘Das Unauslöschliche.’ / Durch den Titel ‘Das Unauslöschliche’ hat der Komponist ver- / sucht mit einem Worte das anzudeuten was nur die Musik selbst / völlig auszudrücken im Stande ist: den

elementären Willen zum Leben. /

Die musik i s t Leben und unauslöschlich wie dieses. Somit / könnte das Wort, das der Komponist als Titel seines Werkes ge- / braucht hat, als überflüssig erscheinen; er hat es indessen verwendet / um den streng musikalischen Charakter seiner Aufgabe zu unterstreichen. / Es soll demgemäss kein Programm sein, sondern ein Wegweiser / durch das eigene Gebiet der Musik. /

‘The Inextinguible.’ /

The composer has tried through this title in one word to in- / dicate what the Music alone is capable of expressing to the full: / The elementary Will of Life. /

The Music i s Life, and like this inextinguible. The title given / by the composer to this musical work might therefore seem super- / fluous; the composer however has employed the word in order to / underline the strictly musical character of this subject. It is not a / programme, but only a suggestive hint on the proper territory of / the Music.”

Filiation and evaluation of sources

There are only two sketches for *The Inextinguishable* (**G**), whose earliest form has been preserved in the pencil draft (**B**). This formed the basis of the ink fair copy (**B**), which formed the printing manuscript for the printed score (Carl Niensens copy (**A**)). All later editions of the symphony have used the original music type, apparently without corrections.

For the first performances of the symphony Carl Nielsen had a set of parts written out; of these the string parts (except for the primo parts) still exist (**D**), and along with the wind and percussion parts they were used for printing.

In the parts that formed the source for the printed parts (**C**), the composer made a number of changes.³

The basis of the present edition is Carl Nielsen's copy (**A**). The printing manuscript (**B**) and the pencil draft (**E**) have been collated with the main source and in many cases have been used to emend it. We have the special situation with *The Inextinguishable*, that Carl Nielsen by all indications used the draft for performance – a number of conductor's notes indicate this. Moreover, a number of factors seem to confirm that the composer made several revisions in the draft – revisions that were not, it should be noted, added

³ Cf. letter to Asger Wilhelm Hansen, 29.6.1916, DK-Kk, Wilhelm Hansen archives

in the printed score. These could then be from the period between the handing-over of the ink fair copy and the appearance of the printed score. The status of the pencil draft as a source has meant that all significant alternative readings have been registered in the editorial commentary. In very many cases the draft, along with other source material, has formed the basis for the emendations in the edition. It must be underlined, however, that in a number of respects the pencil draft includes information that may be valuable as documentation material, but which has been impossible to incorporate in the editorial work because of uncertainty about Carl Nielsen's internal revision practice. This is particularly true of a number of details in the pencil draft which Carl Nielsen could subsequently have changed in the part material and his own copy if he had wanted to keep the changes.